## Punctual structures relative to oracles

#### Kalimullin I.Sh.

Kazan Federal University e-mail:ikalimul@gmail.com

## New Directions in Computability Theory Luminy, France 7-11 March, 2022

Kalimullin I.Sh. Punctual structures relative to oracles

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is identified with the function

$$F_{\mathcal{A}} = f_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus f_M \oplus P_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus P_N \equiv \mathcal{A},$$

i.e.,

$$\begin{split} F_{\mathcal{A}}(i, \langle x_1, \dots, x_{m_i} \rangle) &= f_i(x_1, \dots, x_{m_i}), \text{ for } 1 \leq i \leq M, \\ F_{\mathcal{A}}(i+M, \langle x_1, \dots, x_{n_i} \rangle) &= P_i(x_1, \dots, x_{n_i}), \text{ for } 1 \leq i \leq N. \end{split}$$

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is identified with the function

$$F_{\mathcal{A}} = f_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus f_M \oplus P_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus P_N \equiv \mathcal{A},$$

i.e.,

$$F_{\mathcal{A}}(i, \langle x_1, \ldots, x_{m_i} \rangle) = f_i(x_1, \ldots, x_{m_i}), \text{ for } 1 \leq i \leq M,$$

 $F_{\mathcal{A}}(i+M,\langle x_1,\ldots,x_{n_i}\rangle)=P_i(x_1,\ldots,x_{n_i}), \text{ for } 1\leq i\leq N.$ 

We also usually consider  $\mathcal{A} \equiv \mathcal{D}(\mathcal{A})$ —the atomic diagram of  $\mathcal{A}$ ,

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is identified with the function

$$F_{\mathcal{A}} = f_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus f_M \oplus P_1 \oplus \cdots \oplus P_N \equiv \mathcal{A},$$

i.e.,

$$F_{\mathcal{A}}(i, \langle x_1, \ldots, x_{m_i} \rangle) = f_i(x_1, \ldots, x_{m_i}), \text{ for } 1 \leq i \leq M,$$

$$F_{\mathcal{A}}(i + M, \langle x_1, \ldots, x_{n_i} \rangle) = P_i(x_1, \ldots, x_{n_i}), \text{ for } 1 \leq i \leq N.$$

We also usually consider  $\mathcal{A} \equiv D(\mathcal{A})$ —the atomic diagram of  $\mathcal{A}$ , or replace the operations  $f_i$  by their graphs.

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is computable if  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{A}}$  is computable.

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is computable if  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{A}}$  is computable.

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is punctual (fully primitive recursive) if  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{A}}$  is primitive recursive (KMN, 2017).

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is computable if  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{A}}$  is computable.

An algebraic structure  $\mathcal{A} = (\mathbb{N}, f_1^{m_1}, \dots, f_M^{m_M}, P_1^{n_1}, \dots, P_N^{n_N})$  is punctual (fully primitive recursive) if  $\mathcal{F}_{\mathcal{A}}$  is primitive recursive (KMN, 2017).

Note that in the last case we can not replace  $F_{\mathcal{A}}$  by a set (i.e., by a  $\{0, 1\}$ -valued function).

The degree spectrum of a countable structure  ${\cal B}$  is usually defined as either

► the collection of Turing degrees of isomorphic copies of B on the domain N:

 $\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{B}) = \{X \mid (\exists \mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}) [ \text{ the domain of } \mathcal{A} \text{ is } \mathbb{N} \And \mathcal{A} \equiv_{\mathcal{T}} X ] \}, \text{ or }$ 

► the collection of Turing oracles which compute an isomorphic copy of B on the domain N:

 $\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{B}) = \{ X \mid (\exists \mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}) [ \text{ the domain of } \mathcal{A} \text{ is } \mathbb{N} \And \mathcal{A} \leq_T X ] \}.$ 

But in most cases two these definitions are the same:

Theorem. (Knight, 1986). Let  $\mathcal{B}$  be a structure on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

▶ for every  $X \ge_T \mathcal{B}$  there is a structure  $\mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$  such that  $\mathcal{A} \equiv_T X$ ;

But in most cases two these definitions are the same:

Theorem. (Knight, 1986). Let  $\mathcal{B}$  be a structure on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- ▶ for every  $X \ge_T \mathcal{B}$  there is a structure  $\mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$  such that  $\mathcal{A} \equiv_T X$ ;
- there is a finite subset S ⊂ N such that all permutations of N which fix S are the automorphisms of B

But in most cases two these definitions are the same:

Theorem. (Knight, 1986). Let  $\mathcal{B}$  be a structure on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$ . Then exactly one of the following holds:

- ▶ for every  $X \ge_T \mathcal{B}$  there is a structure  $\mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$  such that  $\mathcal{A} \equiv_T X$ ;
- ▶ there is a finite subset  $S \subset \mathbb{N}$  such that all permutations of  $\mathbb{N}$  which fix S are the automorphisms of  $\mathcal{B}$  (in this case all copies  $\mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$  are computable).

A function f is primitive recursive in a function g, if there is a primitive recursive scheme which uses g and produces f  $(f \leq_{PR} g)$ .

A function f is primitive recursive in a function g, if there is a primitive recursive scheme which uses g and produces f  $(f \leq_{PR} g)$ .

Note that in the last case we can not replace functions by sets (e.g., by their graphs).

A function f is primitive recursive in a function g, if there is a primitive recursive scheme which uses g and produces f  $(f \leq_{PR} g)$ .

Note that in the last case we can not replace functions by sets (e.g., by their graphs).

But if f is primitive recursively bounded (i.e.,  $f(x) \le p(x)$  for some primitive recursive p) then  $f \equiv_{PR} graph(f)$ .

Theorem. (K, not checked, 2022). There is a primitive recursive permutation  $p \neq^* id$  on  $\mathbb{N}$  and a computable set  $C \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  such that for every permutation q on  $\mathbb{N}$  we have

$$(\mathbb{N},q)\cong(\mathbb{N},p)\implies q\not\equiv_{PR}C.$$

Theorem. (K, not checked, 2022). There is a primitive recursive permutation  $p \neq^* id$  on  $\mathbb{N}$  and a computable set  $C \subseteq \mathbb{N}$  such that for every permutation q on  $\mathbb{N}$  we have

$$(\mathbb{N},q)\cong(\mathbb{N},p)\implies q\not\equiv_{PR} C.$$

We will use the following definition:

The punctual degree spectrum of a countable structure  $\mathcal{B}$  is the collection of primitive recursive oracles which primitive recursively compute an isomorphic copy of  $\mathcal{B}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$ :

 $\mathbf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{B}) = \{ f \mid (\exists \mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}) [ \text{ the domain of } \mathcal{A} \text{ is } \mathbb{N} \& \mathcal{A} \leq_{PR} f ] \}.$ 

# Proposition. (KMM, 2021). For every structure $\mathcal{B}$ on the domain $\mathbb{N}$ there is a primitive recursively bounded $\mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}$ such that $\mathcal{A} \leq_{PR} \mathcal{B}$ .

- Proposition. (KMM, 2021). For every structure  $\mathcal{B}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N}$  there is a primitive recursively bounded  $\mathcal{A} \cong \mathcal{B}$  such that  $\mathcal{A} \leq_{PR} \mathcal{B}$ .
- Thus, for every  $f \in \mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{B})$  there is a set  $X \leq_{PR} f$  (i.e., a  $\{0, 1\}$ -valued function) such that  $X \in \mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{B})$ .

Observation. There is a lot of possibilities to code a set C into a structure  $\mathcal{A}_C$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{C}}) = \{X \mid \mathcal{C} \leq_{\mathcal{T}} X\}.$$

Observation. There is a lot of possibilities to code a set C into a structure  $\mathcal{A}_C$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}_C) = \{X \mid C \leq_T X\}.$$

Theorem. (Ash, Knight). Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a structure. A set  $\mathcal{C}$  is computable in every copy  $\mathcal{B} \cong \mathcal{A}$  on the universe  $\mathbb{N}$  if and only if for some fixed parameters  $\vec{a} \in \mathcal{A}$  there are computable mappings into quantifier-free formulae  $n \mapsto \Phi_n$  and  $n \mapsto \Psi_n$  such that

$$n \in C \iff \mathcal{A} \models (\exists \vec{x}) \Phi_n(\vec{x}, \vec{a}),$$
  
 $n \notin C \iff \mathcal{A} \models (\exists \vec{x}) \Psi_n(\vec{x}, \vec{a}).$ 

Observation. There are possibilities to code a set C into a structure  $\mathcal{A}_C$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{\mathsf{PR}}(\mathcal{A}_{\mathsf{C}}) = \{f \mid \mathsf{C} \leq_{\mathsf{PR}} f\}.$$

Observation. There are possibilities to code a set C into a structure  $\mathcal{A}_C$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}_C) = \{f \mid C \leq_{PR} f\}.$$

For example, we can define the finitely generated structure

$$\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{C}} = (\mathbb{N}, \boldsymbol{s}(\boldsymbol{x}) \equiv \boldsymbol{x} + 1, \mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{x})).$$

Observation. There are possibilities to code a set C into a structure  $\mathcal{A}_C$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}_C) = \{f \mid C \leq_{PR} f\}.$$

For example, we can define the finitely generated structure

$$\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{C}} = (\mathbb{N}, \boldsymbol{s}(\boldsymbol{x}) \equiv \boldsymbol{x} + 1, \mathcal{C}(\boldsymbol{x})).$$

Alternatively, we can define the locally finite structure

$$\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{C}} = (\mathbb{N}, t(x, y) \equiv \min(x + 1, y), \mathcal{C}(x)).$$

Theorem. (KMM, 2021). Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be a structure. A set C is primitive recursive in every copy  $\mathcal{B} \cong \mathcal{A}$  on the universe  $\mathbb{N}$  if and only if for some fixed parameters  $\vec{a} \in \mathcal{A}$  there are primitive recursive mappings into quantifier-free formulae  $n \mapsto \Phi_n$  and  $n \mapsto \Psi_n$  such that for every tuple  $\vec{x}$  of pairwisely distinct elements

$$n \in C \iff \mathcal{A} \models \Phi_n(\vec{x}, \vec{a}),$$
  
 $n \notin C \iff \mathcal{A} \models \Psi_n(\vec{x}, \vec{a}).$ 

Corollary. (KMM, 2021). If  $\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid C \leq_{PR} f\}$  for a relational structure  $\mathcal{A}$  then C is primitive recursive.

Corollary. (KMM, 2021). If  $\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid C \leq_{PR} f\}$  for a relational structure  $\mathcal{A}$  then C is primitive recursive.

Note that, a description of degree spectra of relational structures can be hard.

Corollary. (KMM, 2021). If  $\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid C \leq_{PR} f\}$  for a relational structure  $\mathcal{A}$  then C is primitive recursive.

Note that, a description of degree spectra of relational structures can be hard. An example of computable relational structure without punctual presentations is not straightforward (KMN, 2017).

## Folklore Theorem. If $C_1 \mid_T C_2$ then the collection

## $\{X \mid C_1 \leq_T X\} \cup \{X \mid C_2 \leq_T X\}$

is not a degree spectrum of a structure.

## Folklore Theorem. If $C_1 \mid_T C_2$ then the collection

$$\{X \mid C_1 \leq_T X\} \cup \{X \mid C_2 \leq_T X\}$$

is not a degree spectrum of a structure.

The similar forcing arguments give

Theorem. If  $C_1 \mid_{PR} C_2$  then the collection

 $\{f \mid C_1 \leq_{PR} f\} \cup \{f \mid C_2 \leq_{PR} f\}$ 

is not a punctual degree spectrum of a structure.

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset \}.$$

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset \}.$$

Theorem. (K, 2008). There is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

 $\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset' \}.$ 

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset\}.$$

Theorem. (K, 2008). There is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset'\}.$$

Theorem. (ACKLMM, 2016). There is no structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset^{(n)} \},\$$

where  $n \geq 2$ .

 $\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset \}.$ 

$$\mathsf{DS}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ X \mid X \not\leq_T \emptyset \}.$$

In fact, Wehner used a coding the family

$$\mathcal{W} = \{\{n\} \oplus F \mid F \text{ is finite } \& F \neq W_n\}$$

into a structure, where  $W_n$  is the *n*-th c.e. set.

 $\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset\}?$ 

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset \}?$$

Question. For which functions g there is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g\}?$$

Proposition. (K, 2022). If a function g is not primitive recursive then there is a set  $X \leq_{PR} g$  which is not primitive recursive.

Let h be a function which is not bounded by a primitive recursive function.

Let h be a function which is not bounded by a primitive recursive function. Let  $\{P_n^h\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be a Gödel numbering of all sets  $P \leq_{PR} h$ .

Let h be a function which is not bounded by a primitive recursive function. Let  $\{P_n^h\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be a Gödel numbering of all sets  $P \leq_{PR} h$ . Then for the "universal" set

$$U^h = \{ \langle n, m \rangle \mid m \in P^h_n \}$$

we have  $h \not\leq_{PR} U^h$  but  $X \leq_{PR} U^h$  for every set  $X \leq_{PR} h$ .

Let h be a function which is not bounded by a primitive recursive function. Let  $\{P_n^h\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be a Gödel numbering of all sets  $P \leq_{PR} h$ . Then for the "universal" set

$$U^h = \{ \langle n, m \rangle \mid m \in P^h_n \}$$

we have  $h \not\leq_{PR} U^h$  but  $X \leq_{PR} U^h$  for every set  $X \leq_{PR} h$ . Proposition. (K, 2022). The test fails if  $g = U^h$ .

Let h be a function which is not bounded by a primitive recursive function. Let  $\{P_n^h\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be a Gödel numbering of all sets  $P \leq_{PR} h$ . Then for the "universal" set

$$U^h = \{ \langle n, m \rangle \mid m \in P^h_n \}$$

we have  $h \not\leq_{PR} U^h$  but  $X \leq_{PR} U^h$  for every set  $X \leq_{PR} h$ .

Proposition. (K, 2022). The test fails if  $g = U^h$ . So the collection

$$\{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} U^h\}$$

is not the punctual degree spectrum of a structure.

## Coding a family into a structure

Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be a countable family of subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ .

## Coding a family into a structure

Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be a countable family of subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ . Define the structure  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{F}}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \times \mathcal{F}$  with the unary operations

$$r(x, y, U) = (0, y, U),$$
  
 $s(x, y, U) = (x + 1, y, U),$ 

and the unary predicate

$$P(x, y, U) = "x \in U",$$

where  $x, y \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $U \in \mathcal{F}$ .

Let  $\mathcal{F}$  be a countable family of subsets of  $\mathbb{N}$ . Define the structure  $\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{F}}$  on the domain  $\mathbb{N} \times \mathbb{N} \times \mathcal{F}$  with the unary operations

$$r(x, y, U) = (0, y, U),$$
  
 $s(x, y, U) = (x + 1, y, U),$ 

and the unary predicate

$$P(x, y, U) = "x \in U",$$

where  $x, y \in \mathbb{N}$  and  $U \in \mathcal{F}$ .

Proposition. (K, 2022).  $f \in \mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{F}})$  iff there is a  $Y \leq_{PR} f$  such that

$$\mathcal{F} = \{ \mathbf{Y}^{(n)} \mid n \in \mathbb{N} \}.$$

Let  $\{\varphi_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all partially computable functions, and let  $\{P_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all primitive recursive sets.

Let  $\{\varphi_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all partially computable functions, and let  $\{P_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all primitive recursive sets. Then we can define the family

 $\mathcal{V} = \{\{n\} \oplus F \mid F \text{ is finite \& } [\varphi_n(0) \downarrow \Longrightarrow F \neq P_{\varphi_n(0)}]\}.$ 

Let  $\{\varphi_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all partially computable functions, and let  $\{P_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all primitive recursive sets. Then we can define the family

 $\mathcal{V} = \{\{n\} \oplus F \mid F \text{ is finite \& } [\varphi_n(0) \downarrow \Longrightarrow F \neq P_{\varphi_n(0)}]\}.$ 

Theorem. (K, 2022).  $\mathsf{DS}_{\mathsf{PR}}(\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{V}}) = \{ f \mid f \not\leq_{\mathsf{PR}} \emptyset \}.$ 

Let  $\{\varphi_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all partially computable functions, and let  $\{P_n\}_{n\in\mathbb{N}}$  be the Gödel numbering of all primitive recursive sets. Then we can define the family

$$\mathcal{V} = \{\{n\} \oplus F \mid F \text{ is finite \& } [\varphi_n(0) \downarrow \Longrightarrow F \neq P_{\varphi_n(0)}]\}.$$

Theorem. (K, 2022).  $\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}_{\mathcal{V}}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset\}.$ Theorem. (K, 2022). If graph(g) is primitive recursive then there is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g\}.$$

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset \}?$$

Question. For which functions g there is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g\}?$$

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset\}?$$

Yes.

Question. For which functions g there is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g\}?$$

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset\}?$$

Yes.

Question. For which functions g there is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g\}?$$

Yes, for some primitive recursively unbounded g.

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{ f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} \emptyset \}?$$

Yes.

Question. For which functions g there is a structure  $\mathcal{A}$  such that

$$\mathsf{DS}_{PR}(\mathcal{A}) = \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g\}?$$

Yes, for some primitive recursively unbounded g. No, for some primitive recursively bounded g.

## Theorem. (K, 2007) If $C'_1 \equiv_T C'_2 \equiv_T \emptyset'$ then the collection $\{X \mid X \not\leq_T C_1\} \cup \{X \mid X \not\leq_T C_2\}$

is the degree spectrum of a structure.

Theorem. (K, 2007) If  $C'_1 \equiv_T C'_2 \equiv_T \emptyset'$  then the collection  $\{X \mid X \not\leq_T C_1\} \cup \{X \mid X \not\leq_T C_2\}$ 

is the degree spectrum of a structure.

Theorem. (K, 2022) If  $graph(g_1)$  and  $graph(g_2)$  are primitive recursive then the collection

$$\{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g_1\} \cup \{f \mid f \not\leq_{PR} g_2\}$$

is the punctual degree spectrum of a structure.